

Dismissal for alleged incapacity: Loss of Licence / Security Clearance Etc

This checklist has been prepared having regard to the Code of Good Practice: Dismissal; Code of Good Practice: Key Aspects on the Employment of People with Disabilities; Code of Good Practice: Key aspects of HIV/AIDS and Employment; the CCMA Misconduct Arbitration Guidelines and relevant case law

v1

NB: The law does NOT require that each and every factor set out below apply in all cases. The law encourages the minimum of legal formality. This checklist is merely a guide and should be used with care and flexibility.

GLOSSARY: IH (Incapacity hearing), EE (employee); ER (employer); AG (CCMA Arbitration Guidelines on Misconduct); Code (Code of Good Practice: Dismissal); Disability Code (Code of Good Practice: Key aspects on employment of people with disabilities); HIV Code (Code of Good Practice: Key aspects of HIV/AIDS & Employment); Sidumo (Sidumo & Ano v Rustenburg Platinum Mines Ltd (CC)); Edcon (Edcon v Pillemer NO (SCA)).

NB: Ill-health & injury are the most common forms of incapacity. There are however other forms eg imprisonment, military call-up, loss of licence or even a security clearance. Factors to keep in mind: reasons for incapacity; extent of incapacity; whether permanent or temporary; whether it has a partial or complete impact on EE's ability to perform; and whether alternatives exist to dismissal.

PROCEDURAL FAIRNESS

- 1 The procedural issues that arise in incapacity hearings are very similar to those that arise in misconduct related hearings. Consult the checklist for MISCONDUCT in this regard.

SUBSTANTIVE FAIRNESS

- 2 Is there a **collective agreement**? AG66 What are its relevant provisions?
- 3 What are the essential / **core functions** of the EE's job? Is EE capable of performing **fully** or **partly** any of these? If partly, to what extent is he capable of performing? Code 11 Is the incapacity related to **quality** of work or the **quantity** ie the output? What is the required quality or quantity? Is the incapacity having an effect on the quality or quantity?
- 4 Did the incapacity arise as a result of any act or omission in the **workplace** not due to the **negligence** of the EE? Code 10(4) (In these circumstances there is a duty on ER to **accommodate** the incapacity.)
- 5 Has EE been **absent** for a period of time? What is that period? Has EE exhausted all forms of **leave**? Is any further absence expected? Code 10(1)
- 6 Who performed EE's duties in his absence? Have there been **costs** relating to staffing or training? Has there been **loss of productivity**? Has there been decline in workplace morale as a result of EE's absence? Has there been workplace **disruption**? HIV Code 14.4
- 7 Is the EE expected to be **absent** for a further period of time? What is that period? Is that

period reasonable having regard to ER's operational needs?

- 8 Is the incapacity **temporary** or **permanent**? Code 10. If temporary, what is that period?
- 9 Is there any legal process or **appeal** that can be employed to **reverse** or ameliorate the incapacity? Has that process or appeal been attempted? What is the expected duration for the completion of that process or appeal?
- 10 Is the condition **substantially limiting**? This means that in its nature, duration or effects, it substantially limits EE's ability to perform the essential / core functions of the job.
- 11 Having regard to EE's incapacity is he able to work in **safety**? Disability Code 8.2.2 Is there **risk** to EE or others or property which cannot be reduced by reasonable accommodation? Disability Code 8.3.2
- 12 Is it possible for the ER to **reasonably accommodate**? Is it possible to adapt or alter the job, workplace, equipment, or work time to accommodate the EE in an effective or cost effective manner? (Reasonable accommodation can also consist of offering alternative work, reduced work or flexible work as an alternative to dismissal. Disability Code 11.5; Code 11).
- 13 Was EE **consulted** on the most reasonable & practical manner in which he can be accommodated? Is there a report by an occupational therapist, if applicable? Disability Code 6.6 Has the EE made any practical and cost-effective suggestions & have these been considered?
- 14 Would accommodation have imposed "**unjustifiable hardship**" ie would have required significant or considerable difficulty or expense for ER? Disability Code 6.12. (An ER need not accommodate if there is unjustifiable hardship CD 6.11)
- 15 Was EE tested to determine his **fitness** to work in cases where ER on reasonable grounds believed that EE was indeed fit to work? Disability Code 14.2.4
- 16 Is it EE's case that the IH is based on **fabricated** evidence? If so, what is, in EE's view, ER's reason/motive?

DISMISSAL & REMEDIES

- 17 **DISMISSAL:** How have others in a similar situation been treated by ER? Has the treatment been **consistent** – both – historically & contemporaneously? AG77.2.3 Code 7(b)(iii). If not, what has ER done in the past when faced by a similar situation? AG100-103
- 18 Is there any alternative **short of dismissal**? Code 9(b)(iii) (When considering alternatives, relevant factors are the nature of the job, the period of absence, the possibility of securing a temporary replacement or adapting duties.)
- 19 Has EE been offered an **alternative post** that reasonably accommodates his incapacity

even if it is a **demotion**? Is EE agreeable to demotion? Is his refusal to be demoted reasonable?

- 20 Does EE have **long service**? What is the implication of that? (Sidumo)
- 21 What impact would dismissal have on EE? **Personal** / family circumstances? AG106 Who does he support? (Sidumo)
- 22 Can EE be relied upon to perform his duties properly having regard to his incapacity & after reasonable accommodation?
- 23 **REINSTATEMENT / RE-EMPLOYMENT:** Is reinstatement or re-employment **reasonably practicable** or feasible? AG113
- 24 Would reinstatement cause a disproportionate level of **disruption** or **financial burden** to ER? AG115 Has another EE been **appointed** in place of the applicant, even though this is not an obstacle to reinstating a deserving EE? If reinstatement is not reasonably practicable, is **re-employment** a fair outcome? Is there a suitable post & what is the attached remuneration? Has ER shown that reinstatement or re-employment should not be from the **date of the dismissal**? AG115.
- 25 **COMPENSATION:** Factors when awarding compensation for **substantive unfairness:** EE's remuneration & benefits at the time of dismissal; time lapse since dismissal; whether EE has secured alternative employment & if so date thereof & rate of remuneration; whether EE has taken steps to mitigate his losses by finding alternative employment; financial loss suffered by EE; EE's prospects of future employment eg disability, age, experience, education, qualifications & availability of suitable job opportunities; whether EE failed to state a case at DH; whether resolution of dispute was unreasonably delayed & if so who caused the delay; whether there was a condonation for late referral; whether dismissal was both substantively & procedurally unfair; whether EE received any payments from ER over & above that required by law, any collective agreement or contract; whether EE unreasonably refused an offer of reinstatement made in good faith; whether actions of EE led to loss or damage to ER; ER's financial position. Factors when awarding compensation for **procedural unfairness ONLY**, consider whether the lapse was minor or serious & whether it caused prejudice. AG130-136